
Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by RISEandSHOUT51 - 2006/04/21 05:18

Recently I had an Epiphany. I was thinking about the nature of our current BYU student athletes compared to the other athletes within the game of college football. A fellow friend of mine was discussing this issue after last season with a group of us so I thought I would run it passed you guys to see what you thought.

Now this has nothing to do with the size of their biceps, or their natural athletic ability. You see, since the majority of our athletes(LDS) come from homes of comfort, stability, and a loving environment, do you think that its possible that our players lack the tenacity and mental toughness that resides within many other successful athletes throughout the nation? Recently, I watched a news special on the NFL draft that talked about some of top players in the NFL and their life stories. It amazed me at how many of our football stars came from humble circumstances and rough homes where their was no positive influence in their life.

In other words, If I came from the back woods of wyoming, my father was an abusive drunk and I knew that my only activity I could excel in was football, than wouldn't I be even more determined to reach the NFL and play more competitively than the next guy who doesn't know what its like to be poor and endure a rough life? Perhaps, our athletes our too soft and lack that "win or die" attitude that Utah had against us last year. I mean Utah had everything against them last season and they still found a way to get it done.

For example, they had their starting QB out, and two starting receivers hurt as well. Now I'm not just speaking about Utah, but about any successful program such as USC, Texas, Ohio State, or LSU. I think many of their players are playing as if football is their only way out of their unfortunate circumstance and perhaps' their family's circumstance. While at BYU, they know that they'll still get a pat on the back after a terrible loss and all will be better next time. At any major winning program, people would not accept anything but the best, therefore, the players of those programs play the game of football as if it's life or death. Is this lacking in a lot of our BYU players?

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by cougarfan87 - 2006/04/21 06:26

I don't think its a motivational issue with our players. Being rich or having a comfortable background doesn't dull competitiveness. How many rich people do you know that are as competitive as all get out? Some people are just born with a competitive fire. Otherwise LaVell never would have had the "glory days." Why some teams win perennially can really be chalked up to talent, coaching, and execution. At the DI level you have to believe that every one of these guys is competitive, really loves football, and wants to win badly. Why else would they put themselves through the practices, weight lifting, running, etc. while they are going to college? No one likes to lose, and especially those competitive enough to make it onto a college football team. Best example from BYU lore is Ty Detmer. Can you think of anyone more competitive that has ever played for BYU? His Dad was not a drunk that slapped him around, but a football coach that taught his kids how to play.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by RISEandSHOUT51 - 2006/04/23 21:39

quote="cougarfan87"]I don't think its a motivational issue with our players. Best example from BYU lore is Ty Detmer. Can you think of anyone more competitive that has ever played for BYU? His Dad was not a drunk that slapped him around, but a football coach that taught his kids how to play.

In those days at BYU we actually recruited blue chip NON LDS athletes (They actually came to BYU, remember?). Now Bronco has the team singing Nephi's courage, tunnel singing, and disgracing the Tongan culture by performing ancient chants before loosing to Utah. :oops:

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by tm1991 - 2006/04/23 21:50

As to poor kids that have a rough life growing up being better might be true. Then again you have people like Steve Young who wasn't beaten and lived comfortably, who came to BYU, then to the NFL hall of fame. Same goes with

Peyton Manning who is an incredible QB and grew up definatley well off with his dad starting in the NFL, albeit he didn't go to BYU but the argument stands. As to Bronco singing "Nephi's Courage" I'm glad. That doesn't mean I want only LDS kids, but we all know what happened when Crowton tried to bring in people that for the most part happened to probably grow up with a rough life.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by RISEandSHOUT51 - 2006/04/23 22:43

tm1991As to poor kids that have a rough life growing up being better might be true. Then again you have people like Steve Young who wasn't beaten and lived comfortably, who came to BYU, then to the NFL hall of fame. Same goes with Peyton Manning who is an incredible QB and grew up definatley well off with his dad starting in the NFL, albeit he didn't go to BYU but the argument stands. As to Bronco singing "Nephi's Courage" I'm glad. That doesn't mean I want only LDS kids, but we all know what happened when Crowton tried to bring in people that for the most part happened to probably grow up with a rough life.

WOW!!! You're a funny one. I forgot to mention that there are a "few" exceptions to the rule. As for Peyton Manning, he was pushed to limits by a father who expected nothing but the best from his son. Most of our LDS athletes had this mentality...."Work the hardest you can-that's all that matters." Sure, it sounds cute and cliché, but that's not the way many of today's great football players were raised. It was more like..."work your hardest and be the best, or you won't have food on the table." You see the difference? Now, as for the kids that were kicked out of BYU, that was unfortunate. But I hope you know that things like that have happened before-perhaps not publicized or even discovered by the honor code office. It's a shame that we are going to fail in two of our goals-converting more non lds people (Vai Sikahema, Ty Detmer, Curtis Brown, Brian McDonald ect...) and loosing more football games because we discourage them from coming here. Don't worry, this little temporary theme song of "let's have a celestial football team" will eventually faze out as we continue to have loosing seasons and our positive popularity as a team, school, and church begins to decline. The world will forget about the glory years of BYU and eventually the generous booster donations will get smaller and smaller as more and more supporters begin to get more and more angry as they watch their dollars go to more losses to Utah. Trust me, it will happen. Now, once this has happened, the Church will have to make a choice..."do we want to loosen the leash on Bronco and allow him to go after more good upstanding, non-LDS athletes making us a better football team? Or do we want to maintain our obedient mediocre-to-bad football team while keeping our program more safe from public scrutiny after an athlete is caught breaking the honor code? You do understand that Bronco's whole "let's bring in only good, upstanding LDS athletes" theme didn't come from the athletic office don't you? It came from downtown Salt Lake.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by QB23 - 2006/04/23 23:03

I think when two opposing D1 football players are going against each other each of them are playing as hard as they possibly can. Unless your that Smith bastard from Utah last year who gave up a long play to Air Force almost losing the game and completely gave up (Silly Utes). As for all others players, they are going out there to kill or be killed.

This topic reminds me of the Super Bowl last year when Stevens, the tight end for Seattle said, "Well, Jerome Bettis may be coming home to Detroit, but he's leaving Detroit with out the lombardi trophy." Then Jerry Porter the MLB for the Steelers said, in essence, "That's it, now I'm really going to play hard and he's going to wish he'd never said such a terrible thing about my teammate!" The point is, Jerry Porter is smoking crack--You either play at the highest level possible for the biggest game or games of your life or you don't. You don't need any one to disrespect you, to make you play better in the Super Bowl, it shouldn't make a difference. The game itself should be and always is enough incentive to fight your hardest. Especially once you get to the highest level of competition.

I don't think we lack athletes who've not been beaten and starved as children, I think we need better athletes.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by BlueCrew - 2006/04/24 00:02

RISEandSHOUT51

You do understand that Bronco's whole "let's bring in only good, upstanding LDS athletes" theme didn't come from the athletic office don't you? It came from downtown Salt Lake.

So you're not criticizing Bronco, but the leaders of the church? Yeah, I'm pretty sure they have no idea what they're doing. :roll: :roll: :roll: :roll: :roll:

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by Hawkwing - 2006/04/24 09:56

RISEandSHOUT51

You do understand that Bronco's whole "let's bring in only good, upstanding LDS athletes" theme didn't come from the athletic office don't you? It came from downtown Salt Lake.

Wait, could you post a cite to the memo that says BYU will no longer recruit non-lds kids? I must have missed that in the Ensign. A few less non-lds recruits one year does not a change in policy make.

The fact of the matter is that there were several high profile incidents involving some very bad people that depleted our team, I don't think it's that irresponsible to try to build a core of young men who will be less likely to do the same thing and then build out the bridges again, making sure that the young men you bring in are of upstanding character, whatever their religion is.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by JaredCowley - 2006/04/24 10:19

quote="cougarfan87"]I don't think its a motivational issue with our players. Best example from BYU lore is Ty Detmer. Can you think of anyone more competitive that has ever played for BYU? His Dad was not a drunk that slapped him around, but a football coach that taught his kids how to play.

In those days at BYU we actually recruited blue chip NON LDS athletes (They actually came to BYU, remember?). Now Bronco has the team singing Nephi's courage, tunnel singing, and disgracing the Tongan culture by performing ancient chants before loosing to Utah. :oops:

That's simply not true. BYU has rarely landed blue chip non-LDS athletes in football. The reason BYU was so good in its glory days was because they had one of the greatest coaches in college football history who could turn good players into a great team and BYU played a weak schedule nearly every year. BYU's schedule back then was like the schedule that Utah plays against today.

Jared Cowley

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by JaredCowley - 2006/04/24 10:23

RISEandSHOUT51tm1991As to poor kids that have a rough life growing up being better might be true. Then again you have people like Steve Young who wasn't beaten and lived comfortably, who came to BYU, then to the NFL hall of fame. Same goes with Peyton Manning who is an incredible QB and grew up definatley well off with his dad starting in the NFL, albeit he didn't go to BYU but the argument stands. As to Bronco singing "Nephi's Courage" I'm glad. That doesn't mean I want only LDS kids, but we all know what happened when Crowton tried to bring in people that for the most part happened to probably grow up with a rough life.

WOW!!! You're a funny one. I forgot to mention that there are a "few" exceptions to the rule. As for Peyton Manning, he was pushed to limits by a father who expected nothing but the best from his son. Most of our LDS athletes had this mentality...."Work the hardest you can-that's all that matters." Sure, it sounds cute and cliché, but that's not the way

many of today's great football players were raised. It was more like..."work your hardest and be the best, or you won't have food on the table." You see the difference? Now, as for the kids that were kicked out of BYU, that was unfortunate. But I hope you know that things like that have happened before-perhaps not publicized or even discovered by the honor code office. It's a shame that we are going to fail in two of our goals-converting more non Ids people (Vai Sikahema, Ty Detmer, Curtis Brown, Brian McDonald ect...) and loosing more football games because we discourage them from coming here. Don't worry, this little temporary theme song of "let's have a celestial football team" will eventually faze out as we continue to have loosing seasons and our positive popularity as a team, school, and church begins to decline. The world will forget about the glory years of BYU and eventually the generous booster donations will get smaller and smaller as more and more supporters begin to get more and more angry as they watch their dollars go to more losses to Utah. Trust me, it will happen. Now, once this has happened, the Church will have to make a choice..."do we want to loosen the leash on Bronco and allow him to go after more good upstanding, non-LDS athletes making us a better football team? Or do we want to maintain our obedient mediocre-to-bad football team while keeping our program more safe from public scrutiny after an athlete is caught breaking the honor code? You do understand that Bronco's whole "let's bring in only good, upstanding LDS athletes" theme didn't come from the athletic office don't you? It came from downtown Salt Lake.

You're speaking falsehoods here, friend. Bronco doesn't have a philosophy of bringing in "only good, upstanding LDS athletes." That's a fabrication on your part. Bronco's recruiting philosophy is three-fold. His players must (in this order, but they have to possess all three attributes): 1) Be a good player 2) Be willing to live BYU's Honor Code and 3) Have a killer work ethic. That's what he demands and if any BYU fan has a problem with that philosophy, they're a little bit crazy, IMHO.

Jared Cowley

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by kiwibacon - 2006/04/24 10:41

RISEandSHOUT51...and disgracing the Tongan culture by performing ancient chants before loosing to Utah. what is disgraceful is your knowledge of what culture they were honoring (not Tongan) and why they were even doing it. Ohhh...and it wasn't just the Utah game it was every game all season long...some fan you are :roll:

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by Cougy_Monster - 2006/04/24 10:51

If you want people to agree with you, or even take you seriously you've got to stop making stuff up.

Bronco is a great coach. He is doing nothing that you have described in this thread.

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by Y-Town - 2006/04/24 11:02

RISEandSHOUT51

And you have a problem with this :!: :!: :!: :!: :!: :!: :!: :!:

I don't mean to come down on you, but your tone is one that indicates bitterness and objection to what you just stated. As many on this tread have already pointed out, BM nor the church has never come out and said we will only recruit LDS.

Prior to saying what I am about to, you must know that I love BYU Football, and I am blue through and through. With that said, we must all remember who really runs BYU, and its not the Football team. I hope this will never happen, but I would not be surprised if the athletic department continued on it downward path which it was on in recent years (which I believe they have now corrected due to as you say "Orders being sent down from Salt Lake") would lead the Church to say, that's it. No more sports at BYU.

The fact of the matter is, I would miss the sports like no other, but I would support that decision, and those who made the decision. We have to keep the bigger picture in mind. So, if you can't bring your self to support/agree with the leaders of the church as motivation, think of the alternative, and use that as motivation to support the "Orders being sent down from Salt Lake".

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by eldermars - 2006/04/25 03:36

RISEandSHOUT51 In those days at BYU we actually recruited blue chip NON LDS athletes (They actually came to BYU, remember?).

Unlike Todd Watkins, Mike Hall, Rashaun Broadus, and this new kid Mullman right?

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by RISEandSHOUT51 - 2006/04/25 21:23

BlueCrewRISEandSHOUT51

You do understand that Bronco's whole "let's bring in only good, upstanding LDS athletes" theme didn't come from the athletic office don't you? It came from downtown Salt Lake.

So you're not criticizing Bronco, but the leaders of the church? Yeah, I'm pretty sure they have no idea what they're doing. :roll: :roll: :roll: :roll:

Although I'm responding to bluecrew's remarks, this is for everyone "who hath ears to hear." Have you ever seen the movie "Angels in the outfield?" For the record...It is just a movie! I have been accused that I'm questioning the church leaders because I have concerns regarding the success of BYU's football team-or the lack of success I should say. I mean, do you feel that the man upstairs cares that we beat Utah or not? No, he doesn't. Sorry, he doesn't care about football. On this website, I read a great article by Val Hale, our former athletic director. I know what your thinking..."but Hale was fired. He has no credibility." Oh but if I could just remind you of his intriguing wisdom regarding the subject of non-LDS athletes and the importance of them to our University and Church. He states....

"Imagine BYU football without Ty Detmer, James Dye, Keith Rivera, Brian McDonald-Ashford, Robbie Bosco, Lenny Gomes or Tom Holmoe."

"How about men

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by RISEandSHOUT51 - 2006/04/25 21:27

Cougy_MonsterIf you want people to agree with you, or even take you seriously you've got to stop making stuff up.

Bronco is a great coach. He is doing nothing that you have described in this thread.

If you're not taking me seriously, then you wouldn't care to express your distaste for my comments. You and I both know there is truth to what I've said. Take off those thick, blue, blinding shades of yours so that you can face reality and overcome the denial you're in.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by MJ - 2006/04/25 21:51

RISEandSHOUT51 Now, I feel that it's my job as a loving, caring, objectionable, BYU fan, to escort all of you out of this utopiaville we seem to find ourselves in when we stray from the path of realism.

Uhh. . . I hate to inform you but the job has already been taken. Several regulars (i.e. Airwolfe84, Jefe, Al_Habrosky) do a very good job of keeping us on the so called path of realism. You've got a long ways to go before matching their wit, wisdom, and savvy.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by BlueCrew - 2006/04/25 22:46

RISEandSHOUT51

Although I'm responding to bluecrew's remarks, this is for everyone "who hath ears to hear." Have you ever seen the movie "Angels in the outfield?" For the record...It is just a movie! I have been accused that I'm questioning the church leaders because I have concerns regarding the success of BYU's football team-or the lack of success I should say. I mean, do you feel that the man upstairs cares that we beat Utah or not? No, he doesn't. Sorry, he doesn't care about football. On this website, I read a great article by Val Hale, our former athletic director. I know what your thinking..."but Hale was fired. He has no credibility." Oh but if I could just remind you of his intriguing wisdom regarding the subject of non-LDS athletes and the importance of them to our University and Church. He states....

"Imagine BYU football without Ty Detmer, James Dye, Keith Rivera, Brian McDonald-Ashford, Robbie Bosco, Lenny Gomes or Tom Holmoe."

"How about men

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by faithfullonghorn - 2006/04/25 23:53

MJRISEandSHOUT51 Now, I feel that it's my job as a loving, caring, objectionable, BYU fan, to escort all of you out of this utopiaville we seem to find ourselves in when we stray from the path of realism.

Uhh. . . I hate to inform you but the job has already been taken. Several regulars (i.e. Airwolfe84, Jefe, Al_Habrosky) do a very good job of keeping us on the so called path of realism. You've got a long ways to go before matching their wit, wisdom, and savvy.

Uhh, actually I think riseandshout is one of the few making any sense. It sounded pretty witty to me. Come on MJ, stay focused and stick to what is on the threads. You do have to admit that we do find ourselves in a fairyland of football success when in reality, we're just not very good are we. Is there one team that BYU could beat in the top 25?

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by stgeorgefan - 2006/04/25 23:53

#1- HALE WAS AN IDIOT. He says "Imagine BYU football without Detmer, McMahon, James Dye, etc." I say, imagine BYU football without him or anyone in his family. He screwed over the football program and BYU is still trying to recover. He was more worried about money and schmoozin' with his buddies then about winning games.

#2- Bronco did not only recruit 1 non-LDS player.

#3- Please inform the rest of us "blue goggled fans" why you think non-LDS players would even want to play at BYU. Lets see, haven't had a winning record in 4 years, no sex, no booze, curfews, fairly tough academically, slim to none chance of playing in a BCS game, etc., etc., etc.

#4- Didn't Crowton try bringing in a whole bunch of non-LDS recruits? Yeah, if you didn't notice, BYU is still suffereing the

consequences of Crowton's poor recruiting choices. Bronco is trying to bring in guys who will fit in at BYU and want to be here- not guys that won't even make it through their first weekend without getting into trouble. Very well put.. Does anybody know the number of non-lads kids we recruited?

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by stgeorgefan - 2006/04/25 23:55

I meant non-Lds kids...

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by BlueCrew - 2006/04/26 00:03

faithfullonghorn

Is there one team that BYU could beat in the top 25?

Yes. Cal and TCU both finished in the top 25 last year and BYU could beat either of those teams- and almost did.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by JaredCowley - 2006/04/26 04:37

RISEandSHOUT51PS. JARED C, I'M SORRY IF I HAVE HURT YOUR FEELINGS OR OFFENDED ANYBODY ON YOUR LITTLE WEBSITE. PLEASE DON'T ERASE MY ACCOUNT SO THAT I'LL HAVE TO MAKE A NEW ONE USING A DIFFERENT NAME.

I've never been in the habit of censoring what people say or erasing accounts because someone has a different opinion than the majority. And please don't think that what you write on a message board could ever offend me. I have no problem with you stating an opinion.

The reason I corrected you is because you're misinformed. BYU has rarely ever landed non-LDS blue chip recruits like you claim and Bronco has no interest in only recruiting LDS players. You're taking one recruiting season to brand Bronco with your opinion of his recruiting philosophy. Bronco recruited non-LDS athletes, they just didn't come this year. As BYU improves, hopefully that will change.

If this trend continues for two or three years, then it becomes a problem. I don't see that happening.

Again, Rise, your opinion is fine by me. But when you start writing falsehoods as fact, I'll call you on it.

Jared Cowley

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by RISEandSHOUT51 - 2006/04/26 08:54

The reason I corrected you is because you're misinformed. BYU has rarely ever landed non-LDS blue chip recruits like you claim and Bronco has no interest in only recruiting LDS players. You're taking one recruiting season to brand Bronco with your opinion of his recruiting philosophy. Bronco recruited non-LDS athletes, they just didn't come this year. As BYU improves, hopefully that will change.

Jared Cowley

Cowley did I ever say blue chip athletes? What I'm saying is that 23 out of 25 LDS athletes just won't cut it. I believe

BYU's menatilty should be were going to get the best athletes that will live the code. LDS or not shouldn't make a difference. You can't tell me that 23 out of 25 LDS athletes are the best we can recruit. Cowley don't stick words in my mouth that I didn't say, and remember Ty Detmer and Jim Mcmhan were both blue chippers. Sorry when you bear false witness " I have to call you on it"

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by RogDog118 - 2006/04/26 09:17

quote="cougarfan87"]I don't think its a motivational issue with our players. Best example from BYU lore is Ty Detmer. Can you think of anyone more competitive that has ever played for BYU? His Dad was not a drunk that slapped him around, but a football coach that taught his kids how to play.

In those days at BYU we actually recruited blue chip NON LDS athletes (They actually came to BYU, remember?). Now Bronco has the team singing Nephi's courage, tunnel singing, and disgracing the Tongan culture by performing ancient chants before loosing to Utah. :oops:

That would be where you said it. Basic statistics tells us that one needs a large number of samples to predict trends. We have a max of two sample classes of recruits and some commits for 2007; not enough to say there is a trend against recruiting non-LDS athletes. Ultimately, BYU has had a lackluster stretch, small media market, long road to playing in a BCS game and has a very strict honor code. This is what turns away non-LDS athletes, not some ficticious, perceived policy.

Also, the numbers that are cited are of people that SIGNED with BYU. How many non-LDS players were RECRUITED by Bronco but decided to go and play elsewhere? If that were a consistently low number, then you could say that there is a policy against recruiting non-LDS athletes. Otherwise, it looks like it has a lot more to do with the decision of the non-LDS athletes to go elsewhere than a BYU policy against recruiting them.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by snoscythe - 2006/04/26 09:21

RISEandSHOUT51 = Chris Hale??? :shock:

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by Slugger - 2006/04/26 09:42

The legendary John Madden once said he hates when an athlete says "step up". He asks the question, what are you doing the rest of the time? He has a point. Although I slightly disagree with him simply because a situation can create an increased energy level, or an increase in adrenaline (like trying to get out of a burning building, you might put a bit more energy into it than if you were simply hurrying to get to the grocery store before it closed).

The problem with all of this is that athletes with "rough" backgrounds can use that as motivation on the field/court but we see every day how many athletes are unable to capture that and express it only during a competitive sporting event. It usually spills over into their social or family life which ends up in alot of bad criminal activity and tragedy. Considering the trend in sports where performance is everything, is Bronco taking the right approach? I believe he is. Will it work? As a BYU fan I certainly hope so. Point is, if you can choose between Ray Lewis or Peyton Manning to represent your team which personality is the best for your ultimate reputation and image? I think Bronco will be fine and may even revolutionize sports to a degree by leaving out the exceptional athletes with alot of baggage. We can already see it slowly unfolding that way with Philly giving Owens, arguably the best receiver and overall talent in the NFL, the boot out of their organization based on his conduct which he couldn't capture into strictly athletic performance. Same thing with Keyshawn Johnson, Ron Artest. These guys are very skilled at their sport, among the best, but teams and fans are slowly learning that the baggage that comes with it just isn't worth it. I support Bronco and all of those involved and pray that it will all work out in the end. GO COUGARS!!

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by Phillycougar - 2006/04/26 09:54

RISEandSHOUT51

The reason I corrected you is because you're misinformed. BYU has rarely ever landed non-LDS blue chip recruits like you claim and Bronco has no interest in only recruiting LDS players. You're taking one recruiting season to brand Bronco with your opinion of his recruiting philosophy. Bronco recruited non-LDS athletes, they just didn't come this year. As BYU improves, hopefully that will change.

Jared Cowley

Cowley did I ever say blue chip athletes? What I'm saying is that 23 out of 25 LDS athletes just won't cut it. I believe BYU's mentality should be were going to get the best athletes that will live the code. LDS or not shouldn't make a difference. You can't tell me that 23 out of 25 LDS athletes are the best we can recruit. Cowley don't stick words in my mouth that I didn't say, and remember Ty Detmer and Jim McMhan were both blue chippers. Sorry when you bear false witness " I have to call you on it"

I see nothing wrong with missing out on any athlete that when fully explained the honor code decides not to come to BYU. You keep using Jimmy Mac at our prime example of Non-LDS athletes but do you remember what he said about BYU. "The best thing about BYU was seeing it in my rear view mirror." The guy was a great football player but I don't think you would want to argue that he kept the honor code or was a good representative of BYU standards even though he was good on the field.

Ty Detmer was an outstanding guy and you have nothing to back up an argument that he would not have attended BYU today (other than our sorry results that last few years).

If Bronco stresses the Honor code to recruits and says that they will be held accountable for living it and they decide not to come I am fine with that. Because schools don't tell us the recruits they lost out on we do not have the real numbers to tell us how many LDS vs. Non-LDS players were actually recruited and vs how many committed and came. And as such your argument is lame and without REAL facts to support it.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by Hawkwing - 2006/04/26 10:08

Jared Cowley

The reason I corrected you is because you're misinformed. BYU has rarely ever landed non-LDS blue chip recruits like you claim and Bronco has no interest in only recruiting LDS players. You're taking one recruiting season to brand Bronco with your opinion of his recruiting philosophy. Bronco recruited non-LDS athletes, they just didn't come this year. As BYU improves, hopefully that will change.

Jared Cowley

RISEandSHOUT51Cowley did I ever say blue chip athletes?

The answer to that is yes, your post from the 1st page:

RISEandSHOUT51In those days at BYU we actually recruited blue chip NON LDS athletes (They actually came to BYU, remember?).

RISEandSHOUT51Cowley don't stick words in my mouth that I didn't say

No problem there.

I know this is a serious issue for you, but please when you're making your point try to stay consistent and when possible use actual statistics to show your point.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by jhw5 - 2006/04/26 10:16

RiseandShout51 = Phillycougar?

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by Hawkwing - 2006/04/26 10:46

jhw5RiseandShout51 = Phillycougar?

Nah, the quotes were just messed up. Phillycougar's comments don't actually start till after the If you read it like that it makes a lot more sense.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by JaredCowley - 2006/04/26 15:27

RISEandSHOUT51

The reason I corrected you is because you're misinformed. BYU has rarely ever landed non-LDS blue chip recruits like you claim and Bronco has no interest in only recruiting LDS players. You're taking one recruiting season to brand Bronco with your opinion of his recruiting philosophy. Bronco recruited non-LDS athletes, they just didn't come this year. As BYU improves, hopefully that will change.

Jared Cowley

Cowley did I ever say blue chip athletes? What I'm saying is that 23 out of 25 LDS athletes just won't cut it. I believe BYU's menatlity should be were going to get the best athletes that will live the code. LDS or not shouldn't make a difference. You can't tell me that 23 out of 25 LDS athletes are the best we can recruit. Cowley don't stick words in my mouth that I didn't say, and remember Ty Detmer and Jim McMhan were both blue chippers. Sorry when you bear false witness " I have to call you on it"

Man, you have a very short memory. As a refresher, here are your words from this very thread:

"In those days at BYU we actually recruited blue chip NON LDS athletes (They actually came to BYU, remember?)."

So, yes, you did in fact say "blue chip athletes." As for the rest of your argument, I've answered your false claims more than once and I prefer not to do it again. Oh, and great job coming up with two non-LDS blue chips athletes that BYU landed over a span of 15 seasons. Really made your point there!

Jared Cowley

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by dYrtbYkerYder - 2006/04/26 15:59

So, yes, you did in fact say "blue chip athletes." As for the rest of your argument, I've answered your false claims more than once and I prefer not to do it again. Oh, and great job coming up with two non-LDS blue chips athletes that BYU landed over a span of 15 seasons. Really made your point there!

LOL, don't mess with Jared.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by BlueCrew - 2006/04/26 17:35

JaredCowley

Oh, and great job coming up with two non-LDS blue chips athletes that BYU landed over a span of 15 seasons. Really made your point there!

Jared Cowley

And actually Ty Detmer wasn't even really recruited- if I recall correctly- He walked into LaVell's office and said he wanted to play. Anyone care to verify this?

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by mormonrasta - 2006/04/26 20:38

Who cares about LDS vs. Non-LDS!?!? If BYU recruited exclusively in Florida, Texas, California, and Delta High they would be national champs every year!

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by lovelldog - 2006/04/26 21:00

RISEandSHOUT51

Cowley did I ever say blue chip athletes? What I'm saying is that 23 out of 25 LDS athletes just won't cut it. I believe BYU's menatlity should be were going to get the best athletes that will live the code. LDS or not shouldn't make a difference. You can't tell me that 23 out of 25 LDS athletes are the best we can recruit. Cowley don't stick words in my mouth that I didn't say, and remember Ty Detmer and Jim Mcmhan were both blue chippers. Sorry when you bear false witness " I have to call you on it"

I know this argument has been made so many times on this board but we really need to get off this whole idea that non-lds players will come to a school where as Bluecrew mentioned does not allow booze, sex, and whatever else he said when they have had 3 pretty miserable seasons in a row. You could recruit every non-lds player in the nation and I just don't see a reason they would choose BYU over another place. There just aren't that many people who are non-lds who dream about playing at BYU. I mean really what is the selling point at BYU to a non-lds player?

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by BlueCrew - 2006/04/26 21:13

mormonrastaWho cares about LDS vs. Non-LDS!?!? If BYU recruited exclusively in Florida, Texas, California, and Delta High they would be national champs every year!

And China. I'm telling you, that's where BYU needs to start recruiting.

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by cougarfurr - 2006/04/26 23:40

This debate has come up so many times. I'm not trying to start a big fight or criticize anyone...but, lovelldog, and others who feel ask "what is the selling point at BYU to a non-lds player?" I think you are being ignorant and you sound like (im not saying you ARE, but it SOUNDS like) a person who doesn't associate with many non-lds people.

The fact of the matter is, that there ARE plenty of non-lds athletes who do come to byu for the school that it is. Whether that percentage of people is 1% or 99% or 50-50 it doesnt matter. We can't say, oh, non-lds people don;t want to come here. I know a BYU athlete who is annoyed when people ask her why she chose to come to BYU (she's not lds). She's annoyed because people think that no non-lds person would want to come here since "they dont have standards like us". She's offended by it because she says " I do have those standards". She comes here for a good sports program, and the STANDARDS, and the fact that its a good education. This is true in any sport.

Why do so many people act like 99% of the population couldn't live at byu. IT may be true that many college athletes drink, and have sex, etc. But most do because of the environment they live in. There are many that want to come to a good environment so that they won't even confront those decisions.

I'm sure someone will reply with "oh well football players are different". Whatever, save your breath..go make a non-lds friend, it's healthy for you.

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by BlueCrew - 2006/04/27 00:17

cougarfurrThis debate has come up so many times. I'm not trying to start a big fight or criticize anyone...but, lovelldog, and others who feel ask "what is the selling point at BYU to a non-lds player?" I think you are being ignorant and you sound like (im not saying you ARE, but it SOUNDS like) a person who doesn't associate with many non-lds people.

The fact of the matter is, that there ARE plenty of non-lds athletes who do come to byu for the school that it is. Whether that percentage of people is 1% or 99% or 50-50 it doesn't matter. We can't say, oh, non-lds people don't want to come here. I know a BYU athlete who is annoyed when people ask her why she chose to come to BYU (she's not lds). She's annoyed because people think that no non-lds person would want to come here since "they don't have standards like us". She's offended by it because she says "I do have those standards". She comes here for a good sports program, and the STANDARDS, and the fact that it's a good education. This is true in any sport.

Why do so many people act like 99% of the population couldn't live at byu. IT may be true that many college athletes drink, and have sex, etc. But most do because of the environment they live in. There are many that want to come to a good environment so that they won't even confront those decisions.

I'm sure someone will reply with "oh well football players are different". Whatever, save your breath..go make a non-lds friend, it's healthy for you.

4 losing seasons in a row. Now tell me why you think a non-LDS player would want to come to BYU when they have other offers.

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by faithfullonghorn - 2006/04/27 02:11

BlueCrewJaredCowley

Oh, and great job coming up with two non-LDS blue chips athletes that BYU landed over a span of 15 seasons. Really made your point there!

Jared Cowley

And actually Ty Detmer wasn't even really recruited- if I recall correctly- He walked into LaVell's office and said he wanted to play. Anyone care to verify this?

Actually, you're partly correct. He had planned a trip to visit 5 schools with his parents and BYU was first on the list. He came and Ty and his parents loved the school and program so much, they decided to come to BYU before checking out the other schools on his list.

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by faithfullonghorn - 2006/04/27 02:30

cougarfurrThis debate has come up so many times. I'm not trying to start a big fight or criticize anyone...but, lovelldog, and others who feel ask "what is the selling point at BYU to a non-lds player?" I think you are being ignorant and you sound like (im not saying you ARE, but it SOUNDS like) a person who doesn't associate with many non-lds people.

The fact of the matter is, that there ARE plenty of non-lds athletes who do come to byu for the school that it is. Whether that percentage of people is 1% or 99% or 50-50 it doesnt matter. We can't say, oh, non-lds people don;t want to come here. I know a BYU athlete who is annoyed when people ask her why she chose to come to BYU (she's not lds). She's annoyed because people think that no non-lds person would want to come here since "they dont have standards like us". She's offended by it because she says " I do have those standards". She comes here for a good sports program, and the STANDARDS, and the fact that its a good education. This is true in any sport.

Why do so many people act like 99% of the population couldnt live at byu. IT may be true that many college athletes drink, and have sex, etc. But most do because of the environment they live in. There are many that want to come to a good environment so that they wont even confront those decisions.

I'm sure someone will reply with " oh well football players are different". Whatever, save your breath..go make a non-lds friend, it's healthy for you.

Look cougarfurr, I myself, have plenty of non-LDS GUY friends and the fact of the matter is that there are probably zero to zero non-LDS FOOTBALL PLAYERS that have any incentive and reason to come here. Yes, I'm being blunt, but it's true. Sure, you might find an exception on the football team of someone that wanted to come here the past 3 years, but until you give me their name and their story than I would say that it's false. I'm not talking about a female athlete that wanted to play on a successful soccer team or swim team. I'm talking about a legit FOOTBALL athlete who could have played at other D I schools but for some reason chose to come here so that he could play for a losing program AND be restricted from doing the "hippidy dippidy" while getting plastered just so he could forget about it the next morning. Now remember, I'm a realist and I just have to agree with some of the other opinions on this thread that, up until now, we have absolutely zero leverage on any good non-LDS athletes. Ty Detmer didn't come here because he had this unexplainable spiritual sensation that whispered..."come to BYU." I know that some of us would like to believe that but it's just not true. Trust me, I've spoken with him. He came for a number of reasons that were FOOTBALL related. He was impressed with Lavell Edwards and the coaching staff. He loved the offensive scheme and he knew that by coming here, he could throw for 450 yds against any team in the nation. He knew that this was a winning, nationally recognized program that could get him into the NFL ect..ect...ect.. I'm not picking on non-LDS athletes or trying to offend anyone, I'm just saying the cold hard truth.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by jhw5 - 2006/04/27 07:46

faithfullonghornTy Detmer didn't come here because he had this unexplainable spiritual sensation that whispered..."come to BYU." I know that some of us would like to believe that but it's just not true. Trust me, I've spoken with him. He came for a number of reasons that were FOOTBALL related. He was impressed with Lavell Edwards and the coaching staff. He loved the offensive scheme and he knew that by coming here, he could throw for 450 yds against any team in the nation. He knew that this was a winning, nationally recognized program that could get him into the NFL ect..ect...ect..

I read in one those books about him that it was the hunting and fishing that ultimately convinced him. Are there any other non-LDS football players who like to hunt and fish out there (and also love to play DB)?

Just my 2 cents.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by Phillycougar - 2006/04/27 08:46

Hawkwingjhw5RiseandShout51 = Phillycougar?

Nah, the quotes were just messed up. Phillycougar's comments don't actually start till after the If you read it like that it makes a lot more sense.

Apparently I don't know how to make a quote properly. Still new at making comments here.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

cougarfurrThis debate has come up so many times. I'm not trying to start a big fight or criticize anyone...but, lovelldog, and others who feel ask "what is the selling point at BYU to a non-lds player?" I think you are being ignorant and you sound like (im not saying you ARE, but it SOUNDS like) a person who doesn't associate with many non-lds people.

The fact of the matter is, that there ARE plenty of non-lds athletes who do come to byu for the school that it is. Whether that percentage of people is 1% or 99% or 50-50 it doesnt matter. We can't say, oh, non-lds people don;t want to come here. I know a BYU athlete who is annoyed when people ask her why she chose to come to BYU (she's not lds). She's annoyed because people think that no non-lds person would want to come here since "they dont have standards like us". She's offended by it because she says " I do have those standards". She comes here for a good sports program, and the STANDARDS, and the fact that its a good education. This is true in any sport.

Why do so many people act like 99% of the population couldnt live at byu. IT may be true that many college athletes drink, and have sex, etc. But most do because of the environment they live in. There are many that want to come to a good environment so that they wont even confront those decisions.

I'm sure someone will reply with " oh well football players are different". Whatever, save your breath..go make a non-lds friend, it's healthy for you.

Or maybe I am a realistic person who understands that just because you know one person who is non-lds that wanted to go to BYU it doesn't mean that there are a lot more out there like that. I do associate with many non-lds people as I have lived outside of Utah for all but 5 years of my life in several different states and several different countries. I have even had 3 non-lds friends from HS go to BYU (which is probably more than most people) but I am still not naive enough to think that people will go to BYU just because they are good. BYU's non-lds population only consists of 1% of the student body because they don't want to go there not because BYU limits them to 1%.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by jbar1221 - 2006/04/27 11:25

Im not sure if the "hippity dippity" or lack there of is the root of the problem. (Wether we want to admit or not if your non-lds or lds and truly wanna hit the hay you can do so without getting caught) Its the current state of the football program. No one wants to play somewhere they dont think will win, now add the Honor Code ON TOP of that and its easy to see why recruits arent knocking down the door. The best line Ive ever heard about recruiting was said by a coach in response to the old " how do you decide who to recruit?" he grinned and answered " we recruit who we can get." For BYU to "get" these non-lds program saving studs everyones fantasising about we need to get headed back in the right the direction (which it seems like were on that path) If a good recruit wants to play at a school that can win and he feels he can really contribute an Honor Code isnt gonna be such a ridiculous idea, (for the majority, there are those who are gona do what they want LDS and Non-LDS) So, lets win some MORE games this year and see if we cant land some of these guys.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by cougarfan87 - 2006/04/27 12:26

jbar1221Im not sure if the "hippity dippity" or lack there of is the root of the problem. (Wether we want to admit or not if your non-lds or lds and truly wanna hit the hay you can do so without getting caught) Its the current state of the football program. No one wants to play somewhere they dont think will win, now add the Honor Code ON TOP of that and its easy to see why recruits arent knocking down the door. The best line Ive ever heard about recruiting was said by a coach in response to the old " how do you decide who to recruit?" he grinned and answered " we recruit who we can get." For BYU to "get" these non-lds program saving studs everyones fantasising about we need to get headed back in the right the direction (which it seems like were on that path) If a good recruit wants to play at a school that can win and he feels he can really contribute an Honor Code isnt gonna be such a ridiculous idea, (for the majority, there are those who are gona do what they want LDS and Non-LDS) So, lets win some MORE games this year and see if we cant land some of these guys.

I agree, but.....how did we get from "players are better when they're slapped around a lot as kids" to talking about football players doing the "hippity dippity" :?: :?: :?: :?: " :? :? :? :? :? :?

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by cougarfurr - 2006/04/27 20:01

ok longhorn...I don't get it. You say "zero to zero" Yet there currently are football players at byu, who ARE good, were highly recruited, and are not LDS. So how can you say "probably zero to zero" That's my only question. So many people say NO non-lds football player would come here. But there are. So why do you say zero.

I hate to be so obvious that it punches you in the face...but how about Curtis Brown and/or Michael Reed? Both are (were, in brown;s case) non-lds, both had plenty of options. It must piss them off to hear dumb people make stupid assumptions about them and what kind of people they are since they are "SOO different" than an LDS athlete. It's no wonder so many dont come here, probly makes them sick to hear self-righteous byu students talk about them.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by BlueCrew - 2006/04/27 20:06

cougarfurrok longhorn...I don't get it. You say "zero to zero" Yet there currently are football players at byu, who ARE good, were highly recruited, and are not LDS. So how can you say "probably zero to zero" That's my only question. So many people say NO non-lds football player would come here. But there are. So why do you say zero.

I hate to be so obvious that it punches you in the face...but how about Curtis Brown and/or Michael Reed? Both are (were, in brown;s case) non-lds, both had plenty of options. It must piss them off to hear dumb people make stupid assumptions about them and what kind of people they are since they are "SOO different" than an LDS athlete. It's no wonder so many dont come here, probly makes them sick to hear self-righteous byu students talk about them.

Curtis Brown was not highly recruited. Anyway, no one has yet to answer me this question. Why would a non-LDS player want to come to BYU after 4 losing seasons in a row? How do you think Bronco can sell them on BYU if the recruit does indeed have other options?

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by faithfullonghorn - 2006/04/27 20:46

cougarfurrok longhorn...I don't get it. You say "zero to zero" Yet there currently are football players at byu, who ARE good, were highly recruited, and are not LDS. So how can you say "probably zero to zero" That's my only question. So many people say NO non-lds football player would come here. But there are. So why do you say zero.

I hate to be so obvious that it punches you in the face...but how about Curtis Brown and/or Michael Reed? Both are (were, in brown;s case) non-lds, both had plenty of options. It must piss them off to hear dumb people make stupid assumptions about them and what kind of people they are since they are "SOO different" than an LDS athlete. It's no wonder so many dont come here, probly makes them sick to hear self-righteous byu students talk about them.

Settle down and don't get your furr in a wad. I asked you to tell me their story. Go right now and tell me who was actively recruiting and offering Curtis Brown and Michael Reed scholarships. And you know what else furry, I'm sure it does "piss them off to hear dumb people make stupid assumptions about them and what kind of people they are." Hold on for a second I have to finish laughing.....I mean....you sound so passionate.....and.....hahahaha.....okay, I'm done. :lol:

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by cougarfurr - 2006/04/28 00:23

so, if I'm so passionate, then what do you call the essays that you wrote about why Texas is the most incredible state?

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by faithfullonghorn - 2006/04/28 02:12

cougarfurrso, if I'm so passionate, then what do you call the essays that you wrote about why Texas is the most incredible state?

I was just relaying common knowledge, that's all.

=====

Four losing seasons

Posted by DieHardCougar - 2006/04/28 03:20

Ummm...hate to butt into such a heated debate, but...where did "four losing seasons in a row" come from?

=====

Re: Four losing seasons

Posted by BlueCrew - 2006/04/28 08:44

DieHardCougarUmmm...hate to butt into such a heated debate, but...where did "four losing seasons in a row" come from?

If Bronco can a 6-6 season a winning season, then I can just as easily call it a losing season. That makes 4 in a row.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by Buckshot - 2006/04/28 09:42

Ryan Kessman is not LDS and is/will continue to be highly recruited. Have you seen his highlight film? Once he is evaluated by scout he should be a 4-star recruit.

He is the perfect answer to the question "why would any top notch non-lds recruit want to come to BYU after four seasons without a winning record?" Answer: He loves Bronco, he wants his college experience to be in a moral environment, and he buys into the tradition of BYU's past. He isn't coming here to have four years of winless seasons-- he can sense, as well as we can, that BYU football is back on track. Believe it or not, there are good FOOTBALL PLAYERS who have morals and are not mormon.

If you want to tell me he is "only a verbal commit" you can save it. I know that and I have no worries that Ryan will not be in cougar blue come 2007.

=====

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by Cougy_Monster - 2006/04/28 10:20

This debate has been on so many threads....and it just goes in circles. The bottom line is those who say Bronco only wants LDS athletes on the team are wrong. He has made it crystal clear to anyone who wants to know that he will recruit (and hopefully land) the best athletes in the country who will commit to living the honor code--LDS or not.

The problem with this debate is that someone says something to the effect that the majority of good high school athletes will not want to play at BYU because of either #1 they think BYU's team sucks or #2 they would like to have some facial hair or wear daisy dukes to class. Then, somebody in a fit of passion will interpret that as meaning everyone who isn't LDS is a disgusting drunk pimp loser. Then the accusations of self-righteousness and holier-than-thou start flying..... :roll:

Don't we all agree that those good high school athletes willing to live the honor code (whether they be LDS or not) are

the minority? I mean come on, most 18 year olds don't want to move out of their house only to have an opposite-sex curfew. PLEASE, don't interpret that as my saying that somehow everyone is evil except me and John Beck. I'm confident that as BYU wins more games there will be many non-LDS, high-caliber recruits hoping they can play in Anae's offense.

I think we all, including Bronco, believe that the Cougs will be a national power if BYU can #1 land (almost) every LDS athlete 3-stars or better (only if they are willing to live the honor code) and #2 find, recognize and effectively recruit as many non-lds athletes as possible (again, only if they are willing to live the honor code).

In the end the issue is not LDS vs non-LDS. It's all about the honor code, which is more than alcohol and sex--it's also about daisy dukes :D .

Nature vs. Nurture

Posted by Beef05 - 2006/04/28 11:05

K guys seriously what does it matter if there LDS or not?? honestly who cares, its there life let them lead the life they want. just play ball hard. I mean grow up. OH he's LDS he must suck or he's not LDS he must be the devil blah blah blah whatever man who really cares???? as long as they bring it on saturdays.

Re: Four losing seasons

Posted by DieHardCougar - 2006/04/28 11:08

BlueCrewDieHardCougarUmmm...hate to butt into such a heated debate, but...where did "four losing seasons in a row" come from?

If Bronco can a 6-6 season a winning season, then I can just as easily call it a losing season. That makes 4 in a row.

I don't care what Bronco calls a winning season. I'm only saying that 6-6 is not a losing season.

Re: Four losing seasons

Posted by BlueCrew - 2006/04/28 11:13

DieHardCougarBlueCrewDieHardCougarUmmm...hate to butt into such a heated debate, but...where did "four losing seasons in a row" come from?

If Bronco can a 6-6 season a winning season, then I can just as easily call it a losing season. That makes 4 in a row.

I don't care what Bronco calls a winning season. I'm only saying that 6-6 is not a losing season.

OK. 4 non-winning seasons in a row. Either way you look at it, it's not attractive to potential recruits.